

The transition temperature of the dilute interacting Bose gas for N internal degrees of freedom

Gordon Baym,^{a,b,c} Jean-Paul Blaizot,^b and Jean Zinn-Justin^b

^a*University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1110 W. Green St., Urbana, IL 61801*

^b*CEA-Saclay, Service de Physique Théorique, 91191 Gif-sur-Yvette Cedex, France*

^c*Ecole Normale Supérieure, 24 r. Lhomond, 75006 Paris, France*

Abstract

We calculate explicitly the variation δT_c of the Bose-Einstein condensation temperature T_c induced by weak repulsive two-body interactions to leading order in the interaction strength. As shown earlier by general arguments, $\delta T_c/T_c$ is linear in the dimensionless product $an^{1/3}$ to leading order, where n is the density and a the scattering length. This result is non-perturbative, and a direct perturbative calculation of the amplitude is impossible due to infrared divergences familiar from the study of the superfluid helium lambda transition. Therefore we introduce here another standard expansion scheme, generalizing the initial model which depends on one complex field to one depending on N real fields, and calculating the temperature shift at leading order for large N . The result is explicit and finite. The reliability of the result depends on the relevance of the large N expansion to the situation $N = 2$, which can in principle be checked by systematic higher order calculations. The large N result agrees remarkably well with recent numerical simulations.

I. INTRODUCTION

The effect of a weak repulsive two-body interaction on the transition temperature of a dilute gas Bose gas at fixed density has been controversial for a long time [1–6]. It has recently been established theoretically [7] that T_c increases linearly with the strength of the interaction parametrized in terms of the scattering length a . However the coefficient cannot be obtained from perturbation theory. In Ref. [7] a simple self-consistent approximation was used to derive an explicit estimate.

In this article we first give a more direct derivation of the linear behavior, using general renormalization group arguments. Recognizing that the Hamiltonian of the system under study, which also describes the helium superfluid transition, is a particular example of the general N vector model, for $N=2$, we generalize the problem to arbitrary N . This generalization makes new tools available; in particular, the coefficient of $\Delta T_c/T_c$ can be calculated by carrying out an expansion in $1/N$. Here we calculate explicitly to leading order in $1/N$. The result happens to be independent of N , for non-trivial reasons. The calculation involves subtle technical points which are most easily dealt with by dimensional regularization. Surprisingly our result is in remarkable agreement with the most recent numerical simulations [8].

This paper is organized as follows: In Sec. II we lay out the basics of the problem. Then in Sec. III we present the general N vector model and analyze the behavior of the temperature shift by renormalization group arguments. Finally in Sec. IV we calculate the leading order contribution.

II. CLASSICAL FIELD THEORY OF THE BOSE-EINSTEIN CONDENSATION

We consider a system of identical bosons of mass m , at temperature T close to the critical temperature T_c . The effective Hamiltonian of the system may be written as:

$$\mathcal{H} = \int d^3x \left(\frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \nabla \psi^\dagger(x) \cdot \nabla \psi(x) - \mu \psi^\dagger(x) \psi(x) + \frac{2\pi \hbar^2 a}{m} \psi^\dagger(x) \psi^\dagger(x) \psi(x) \psi(x) \right), \quad (1)$$

where $\psi^\dagger(x)$ and $\psi(x)$ are the creation and the annihilation operators of the bosons, a is the scattering length, and μ is the chemical potential. Since we are interested in long wavelength phenomena, we have replaced the two-body potential by a delta function pseudopotential, with strength proportional to the scattering length a . We furthermore assume that $a \ll \lambda$, where

$$\lambda = \sqrt{\frac{2\pi \hbar^2}{mk_B T}} \quad (2)$$

is the thermal wavelength. (In the following we use units $\hbar = k_B = 1$, and write simply $\lambda^2 = 2\pi/mT$.)

To compute the effects of the interactions on the transition temperature, we write the particle number density as a sum of the single particle Green's function over Matsubara frequencies $\omega_\nu = 2\pi i\nu T$:

$$n = -T \int \frac{d^3k}{(2\pi)^3} \sum_\nu G(k, \omega_\nu). \quad (3)$$

Above the transition, the single particle Green's function obeys the equation:

$$G^{-1}(k, z) = z + \mu - \frac{k^2}{2m} - \Sigma(k, z). \quad (4)$$

The Bose-Einstein condensation temperature is determined by the point where $G^{-1}(0, 0) = 0$, i.e., where $\Sigma(0, 0) = \mu$. At this point,

$$G^{-1}(k, z) = z - \frac{k^2}{2m} - (\Sigma(k, z) - \Sigma(0, 0)). \quad (5)$$

At T_c the spatial Fourier transform of the two-point correlation function at zero frequency diverges at zero momentum, and so does the correlation length.

In the absence of interactions, $\mu = 0$ at the transition, and

$$n = \zeta(3/2)/\lambda_c^3 \quad (6)$$

where $\lambda_c^2 = 2\pi/mT_c^0$, and T_c^0 is the condensation temperature of the ideal gas.

In the presence of weak interactions, the temperature of the Bose-Einstein condensation becomes the critical temperature of the interacting model, and is shifted by the interactions. From the theory of critical phenomena we know that the variation of the critical temperature in systems with dimension d below four depends primarily on contributions from the small momenta or large distance (which we refer to as the infrared, or IR) region. This property, which we later verify explicitly for $d = 3$, simplifies the problem, since to leading order the IR properties are only sensitive to the $\omega_\nu = 0$ component.

As shown in Ref. [7], in the dilute limit where only the $\omega_\nu = 0$ Matsubara frequency contributes, the shift in the transition temperature at fixed density, $\Delta T_c = T_c - T_c^0$, can be related to the change Δn in the density at fixed T_c by:

$$\frac{\Delta T_c}{T_c} = -\frac{2}{3} \frac{\Delta n}{n}, \quad (7)$$

where

$$\Delta n = \frac{2}{\pi\lambda^2} \int_0^\infty dk k^2 \left(\frac{1}{k^2 + U} - \frac{1}{k^2} \right), \quad (8)$$

and

$$U(k) \equiv 2m(\Sigma(k) - \Sigma(0)). \quad (9)$$

Once restricted to their zero Matsubara frequency components, the fields ψ and $\psi^\dagger$ can be considered as classical fields, and the entire calculation can be cast in terms of classical field theory. It is then convenient to rescale the field ψ in order to introduce more conventional field theory normalizations, and to parametrize it in terms of two real fields ϕ_1, ϕ_2 : $\psi = \sqrt{mT}(\phi_1 + i\phi_2)$. The partition function then reads

$$\mathcal{Z} = \int [d\phi(x)] \exp[-\mathcal{S}(\phi)], \quad (10)$$

where $\mathcal{S}(\phi) = H/T$ is given by :

$$\mathcal{S}(\phi) = \int \left\{ \frac{1}{2} [\partial_\mu \phi(x)]^2 + \frac{1}{2} r \phi^2(x) + \frac{u}{4!} [\phi^2(x)]^2 \right\} d^d x, \quad (11)$$

where $r = -2mT\mu$, and:

$$u = 96\pi^2 \frac{a}{\lambda^2}. \quad (12)$$

In Eq. (11) we have kept the dimension d of the spatial integration arbitrary in order to use dimensional regularization later. The single particle Green's function $G(p)$ is related to the inverse two-point function $\Gamma^{(2)}(p)$ of the classical field theory by

$$G(p) = \frac{2mT}{\Gamma^{(2)}(p)}. \quad (13)$$

The model described by the Euclidean action (11) reduces to the ordinary $O(2)$ symmetric ϕ^4 field theory, which indeed describes the universal properties of the superfluid helium transition. As it stands this field theory suffers from UV divergences. These are absent in the original theory, the higher frequency modes providing a large momentum cutoff $\sim \sqrt{mT} \sim 1/\lambda$. This cutoff may be restored when needed, e.g., by replacing the propagator by the regularized propagator:

$$\frac{2mT}{k^2} \rightarrow \frac{1}{e^{k^2/2mT} - 1}. \quad (14)$$

In fact, as we show later, since the shift of the critical temperature is dominated by long distance properties it is independent of the precise cutoff procedure.

A second effect of the non-zero frequency modes is to renormalize the effective coefficients of the Euclidean action. This problem can be explored by writing the functional integral representation of the complete quantum theory and integrating over the non-zero modes perturbatively. The corrections generated are of higher order in a and can thus be neglected.

Because the interactions are weak, one may imagine calculating the change in the transition temperature by perturbation theory. However the perturbative expansion for a critical theory does not exist for any fixed dimension $d < 4$; IR divergences prevent a complete calculation. If one introduces an infrared cutoff k_c to regulate the momentum integrals, one finds that perturbation theory breaks down when $k_c \sim a/\lambda^2$, all terms being then of the same order of magnitude. To discuss this problem in more detail we now generalize the model to N component fields with an $O(N)$ symmetric Hamiltonian.

III. THE N -VECTOR MODEL. RENORMALIZATION GROUP

We consider the $O(N)$ symmetric generalization of the model corresponding to the Euclidean action (11). The field $\phi(x)$ then has N real components, and, e.g.,

$$\phi^2 = \sum_{i=1}^N \phi_i^2. \quad (15)$$

The action $\mathcal{S}(\phi)$ is still given by Eq. (11), now with an $O(N)$ symmetry. The advantage of this generalization is that it provides us with a tool, the large N expansion, which allows us to calculate at the critical point [10–12].

The goal is to obtain the leading order non-trivial contribution at criticality (in the massless theory) to

$$n = 2mT \sum_{i=1}^N \langle \phi_i^2 \rangle \equiv 2mT N \rho, \quad (16)$$

with

$$\rho = \int \frac{d^d k}{(2\pi)^d} \frac{1}{\Gamma^{(2)}(k)}. \quad (17)$$

Here $\delta_{ij}/\Gamma^{(2)}(k)$ is the connected two-point correlation function.

We now recover, by a simple renormalization group analysis, the result of [7] that the change in ρ due to the interaction is linear in the coupling constant. We introduce a large momentum cutoff $\Lambda \propto \sqrt{mT} \sim 1/\lambda$, and the dimensionless coupling constant g

$$g = \Lambda^{d-4} u \propto \left(\frac{a}{\lambda}\right)^{d-2}. \quad (18)$$

At T_c the inverse two-point function in momentum space satisfies the renormalization group equation [9]

$$\left(\Lambda \frac{\partial}{\partial \Lambda} + \beta(g) \frac{\partial}{\partial g} - \eta(g)\right) \Gamma^{(2)}(p, \Lambda, g) = 0. \quad (19)$$

This equation with dimensional analysis implies that the two-point function has the general form

$$\Gamma^{(2)}(p, \Lambda, g) = p^2 Z(g) F(p/\Lambda(g)); \quad (20)$$

on dimensional grounds $\Lambda(g)$ is proportional to Λ , with

$$\beta(g) \frac{\partial \ln Z(g)}{\partial g} = \eta(g), \quad (21a)$$

$$\beta(g) \frac{\partial \ln \Lambda(g)}{\partial g} = -1. \quad (21b)$$

Since $\beta(g) = -(4-d)g + (N+8)g^2/48\pi^2 + \mathcal{O}(g^3)$, $\beta(g)$ is of order g for small g in $d < 4$; similarly $\eta(g) = (N+2)g^2/(72(8\pi^2)^2) + \mathcal{O}(g^3)$. Therefore

$$Z(g) = \exp \int_0^g \frac{\eta(g')}{\beta(g')} dg' = 1 + \mathcal{O}(g^2); \quad (22)$$

to leading order $Z(g) = 1$. The function $\Lambda(g)$ is then obtained by integrating Eq. (21b),

$$\Lambda(g) = g^{1/(4-d)} \Lambda \exp \left[- \int_0^g dg' \left(\frac{1}{\beta(g')} + \frac{1}{(4-d)g'} \right) \right]. \quad (23)$$

The scale $\Lambda(g)$ plays a specific role in the analysis as the crossover separating a universal long-distance regime, where

$$\Gamma^{(2)}(p) \propto p^{2-\eta} \quad p \ll \Lambda(g), \quad (24)$$

governed by the non-trivial zero, g^* , of the β -function, from a universal short distance regime governed by the Gaussian fixed point, $g = 0$, where

$$\Gamma^{(2)}(p) \propto p^2 \quad \Lambda(g) \ll p \ll \Lambda. \quad (25)$$

However such a regime exists only if $\Lambda(g) \ll \Lambda$, i.e., if there is an intermediate scale between the IR and the microscopic scales; otherwise only the IR behavior can be observed. In a generic situation g is of order unity, and thus $\Lambda(g)$ is of order Λ , and the universal large momentum region is absent. Instead $\Lambda(g) \ll \Lambda$ implies

$$g^{1/(4-d)} \exp \left[- \int_0^g dg' \left(\frac{1}{\beta(g')} + \frac{1}{(4-d)g'} \right) \right] \ll 1. \quad (26)$$

Since g (equal to a/λ , see Eq. (18)) is $\ll 1$, this condition is satisfied in the present situation.

We now show that with this condition, $\Delta T_c \propto \Lambda(g)$. First, from the $g = 0$ limit we infer that $F(\infty) = 1$ (see Eq. (20).) In three dimensions the function $F(p)$ behaves for large p as

$$F(p) = 1 + \mathcal{O}(\ln p/p^2), \quad (27)$$

as can be seen directly from 3-d perturbation theory. Therefore the first correction to the density (17) is convergent at large momentum and independent of the cutoff procedure,

$$\delta\rho = \int \frac{d^3p}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{p^2} \left(\frac{1}{F(p/\Lambda(g))} - 1 \right). \quad (28)$$

Similarly the IR scaling result (Eq. 24) implies that this integral is IR convergent. Setting $p = \Lambda(g)k$, we then find the general form

$$\delta\rho = \Lambda(g) \int \frac{d^3k}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{k^2} \left(\frac{1}{F(k)} - 1 \right); \quad (29)$$

the g dependence is entirely contained in $\Lambda(g)$. For g small we conclude

$$\frac{\delta\rho}{\rho} \propto g \propto an^{1/3}, \quad (30)$$

in agreement with [7]. It is important to note that both the perturbative large momentum region and the non-perturbative IR region contribute to the integral in Eq. (29). Therefore we cannot evaluate it from a perturbative calculation of the function $F(p)$. However, we now show, we can calculate $\delta\rho$ exactly in an $1/N$ expansion.

IV. THE LARGE N EXPANSION AT ORDER $1/N$

Critical phenomena can be studied in any fixed dimension by the now standard technique of large N expansion, where the large N limit is taken at Nu fixed. To leading order the critical two-point function has simply its free field form. However a non-trivial correction is generated at order $1/N$; one finds the inverse two-point function [13,9],

$$\Gamma^{(2)}(p) = p^2 + \frac{2}{N} \int \frac{d^d q}{(2\pi)^d} \frac{1}{(6/Nu) + B(q)} \left(\frac{1}{(p+q)^2} - \frac{1}{q^2} \right) + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{1}{N^2}\right), \quad (31)$$

where $B(q)$ is the one-loop contribution to the four-point function

$$B(q) = \int \frac{d^d k}{(2\pi)^d} \frac{1}{k^2(k+q)^2}. \quad (32)$$

Note that in the large N limit, the chemical potential μ is proportional to $1/N$. Using the large N value of g^* , and setting $\varepsilon = 4 - d$, we can write $B(q)$ for $q \rightarrow 0$:

$$B(q) = b(\varepsilon)q^{-\varepsilon} - \frac{6}{Ng^*}\Lambda^{-\varepsilon} + \mathcal{O}(1/\Lambda^2), \quad (33)$$

with

$$b(\varepsilon) = -\frac{2}{\sin(\pi d/2)} \frac{\Gamma^2(d/2)}{\Gamma(d-1)} N_d, \quad (34)$$

where N_d is the usual loop factor

$$N_d = \frac{2}{(4\pi)^{d/2} \Gamma(d/2)}, \quad N_3 = \frac{1}{2\pi^2}. \quad (35)$$

For $d = 3$, $b(1) = 1/8$.

In the large N limit the β -function takes the simple form $\beta(g) = -\varepsilon g(1 - g/g^*)$. Therefore the leading cutoff-dependent correction to $B(q)$ combines with $6/Nu$ to yield $(6/N)\Lambda^{-\varepsilon}(g)$, as expected from renormalization group arguments. This cutoff dependent correction can be neglected for small g .

We evaluate

$$\delta\rho = -\frac{2}{N} \int \frac{d^d p}{(2\pi)^{2d}} \frac{1}{p^4} \frac{d^d q}{(6/Nu) + b(\varepsilon)q^{-\varepsilon}} \left(\frac{1}{(p+q)^2} - \frac{1}{q^2} \right) \quad (36)$$

by keeping the dimension d generic and using dimensional regularization [14]. The integral over p is

$$\begin{aligned} \int \frac{d^d p}{(2\pi)^d} \frac{1}{p^4} \frac{1}{(p+q)^2} &= \frac{1}{(4\pi)^{d/2}} \frac{\Gamma(3-d/2)\Gamma(d/2-1)\Gamma(d/2-2)}{\Gamma(d-3)} q^{d-6}. \\ &= \frac{1}{(4\pi)^{d/2}} \frac{\Gamma(d/2-1)}{\Gamma(d-3)} \frac{\pi}{\sin \pi d/2} q^{d-6}. \end{aligned} \quad (37)$$

Note that the singularity at $d = 3$, which would apparently entail the vanishing of the integral, is cancelled in the subsequent q integral, which reduces to

$$\int \frac{d^d q}{(2\pi)^d} \frac{q^{d-6}}{(6/Nu) + b(\varepsilon)q^{-\varepsilon}} = \frac{N_d}{4-d} \frac{\pi}{\sin(\pi(d-2)/(4-d))} b^{(2d-6)/(4-d)} \left(\frac{6}{Nu} \right)^{(2-d)/(4-d)}, \quad (38)$$

In the $d = 3$ limit the two integrations in Eq. (36) yield $(1/32\pi^2)(Nu/6)$. As expected, $\delta\rho \propto u$:

$$\delta\rho = -Ku, \quad K = \frac{1}{96\pi^2}, \quad (39)$$

or in terms of the original parameters,

$$\delta\rho = -\frac{a}{\lambda^2}. \quad (40)$$

It is instructive to repeat the calculation directly at $d = 3$. To do this, we first eliminate the constant term (which does not contribute), and write $U(k)$, which equals $\Gamma^{(2)}(k) - k^2$, as

$$U(k) = -2N \left(\frac{u}{6}\right)^2 \int \frac{d^3q}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{B(q)}{1 + (Nu/6)B(q)} \left(\frac{1}{(k-q)^2} - \frac{1}{q^2} \right) \quad (41)$$

From Eq. (41) we find

$$U(k) = -32\pi^2 N k \frac{a^2}{\lambda^4} \int_0^\infty \frac{dx}{kx + 2\pi^2 a N / \lambda^2} \left(\frac{x}{2} \ln \left| \frac{1+x}{1-x} \right| - 1 \right). \quad (42)$$

Calculating the change in the density in leading order in $U \sim 1/N$, one gets:

$$\delta\rho = \frac{8a}{\pi^2 \lambda^2} \int_0^\infty \frac{dk}{k} \int_0^\infty \frac{dx}{1 + \tau x k} \left(\frac{x}{2} \ln \left| \frac{1+x}{1-x} \right| - 1 \right), \quad (43)$$

where $\tau = \lambda^2/(2\pi^2 a N)$. The trick now is to exchange the orders of the k and x integrals. In three dimensions, however, the integrals are not absolutely convergent, preventing this interchange. Thus we introduce a regularization, with by inserting a factor k^ϵ in the k integral, and take the limit $\epsilon \rightarrow 0^+$. With this factor we may exchange the orders of integration. For small ϵ the k integral becomes

$$\int_0^\infty dk \frac{k^{\epsilon-1}}{1 + \tau x k} = \frac{1}{\epsilon(\tau x)^\epsilon}. \quad (44)$$

The factor τ^ϵ goes to unity, and the remaining x integral becomes

$$\int dx x^{-\epsilon} \left(\frac{x}{2} \ln \left| \frac{1+x}{1-x} \right| - 1 \right). \quad (45)$$

For $\epsilon = 0$ this integral vanishes identically. Thus we may replace $x^{-\epsilon}$ by $x^{-\epsilon} - 1$ which goes to $-\epsilon \ln x$ as $\epsilon \rightarrow 0$. The remaining integral is

$$\int dx \ln x \left(\frac{x}{2} \ln \left| \frac{1+x}{1-x} \right| - 1 \right) = -\frac{\pi^2}{8}. \quad (46)$$

The factors of ϵ cancel out, and we find, as before (Eq. (40)), $\delta\rho = -a/\lambda^2$.

Using this result in Eq. (7), we finally obtain the change in the transition temperature:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\Delta T_c}{T_c} &= \frac{8\pi}{3\zeta(3/2)} \frac{a}{\lambda} \\ &= \frac{8\pi}{3\zeta(3/2)^{4/3}} a n^{1/3} = 2.33 a n^{1/3}, \end{aligned} \quad (47)$$

Note that although the final result does not depend on N and therefore replacing N by two is easy, the result is only valid for N large. The result (47) is in remarkable agreement with the ($N = 2$) value $\Delta T_c/T_c^0 \approx (2.2 \pm 0.2) a n^{1/3}$ in the recent numerical simulations of Holzmann and Krauth [8].

V. CONCLUSION

In this paper we have shown that the properties of the weakly interacting Bose gas remain dominated by the UV fixed point of the renormalization group equations up to very

large length scales; this is why we can still refer to the Bose-Einstein condensation when discussing the phase transition of the dilute interacting Bose gas. Renormalization group arguments also enabled us to confirm directly that the shift of the transition temperature at fixed density is proportional to the dimensionless combination $an^{1/3}$ for weak interactions. This result is non-perturbative, and the proportionality coefficient cannot be obtained from perturbation theory. We have therefore introduced a non-perturbative method, the large N expansion, which allows a systematic calculation of this coefficient as a power series in $1/N$, where eventually one has to set $N = 2$. Finally we have calculated explicitly the leading order contribution. The first correction is formally of order $1/N$ multiplied by a function of the product aN which is fixed in the large N limit. Because the final result in three dimensions is linear in a , the $1/N$ factor somewhat surprisingly cancels, and the result is independent of N . The value found is in remarkable agreement with the most recent numerical estimates. Whether this agreement is just a coincidence or reflects the smallness of the next order (of order $1/N$) correction can only be checked by an explicit calculation.

Acknowledgments. This work was facilitated by the Cooperative Agreement between the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign and the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, and also supported in part by National Science Foundation Grant PHY98-00978.

REFERENCES

- [1] T.D. Lee and C.N. Yang, *Phys. Rev.* **112**, 1419 (1957).
- [2] K. Huang, in *Stud. Stat. Mech*, **II**, J. de Boer and G.E. Uhlenbeck, eds. (North Holland Publ., Amsterdam, 1964), 1.
- [3] T. Toyoda, *Ann. Phys. (NY)* **141**, 154 (1982).
- [4] H.T.C. Stoof, *Phys. Rev.* **A45**, 8398 (1992); M. Bijlsma and H.T.C. Stoof, *Phys. Rev.* **A54**, 5085, 1996.
- [5] P. Grüter, D. Ceperley, and F. Laloë, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **79**, 3549, 1997.
- [6] M. Holzmann, P. Grüter, and F. Laloë, cond-mat/9809356, *Euro. Phys. J. B* (in press).
- [7] G. Baym, J.-P. Blaizot, M. Holzmann, F. Laloë, and D. Vautherin. Submitted to *Phys. Rev. Letters*, cond-mat/9905430.
- [8] M. Holzmann and W. Krauth, cond-mat/9905198.
- [9] J. Zinn-Justin, *Quantum Field Theory and Critical Phenomena*, Clarendon Press (Oxford 1989, third ed. 1996).
- [10] H.E. Stanley, *Phys. Rev.* 176 (1968) 718; R. Abe, *Prog. Theor. Phys.* 48 (1972) 1414; *ibidem* 49 (1973) 113; S.K. Ma, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 29 (1972) 1311, *Phys. Rev.* A7 (1973) 2172; M. Suzuki, *Phys. Lett.* 42A (1972) 5, *Prog. Theor. Phys.* 49 (1973) 424; K.G. Wilson, *Phys. Rev.* D7 (1973) 2911.
- [11] See also the contributions of S.K. Ma and E. Brézin, J.C. Le Guillou and J. Zinn-Justin to *Phase Transitions and Critical Phenomena* vol. 6, C. Domb and M.S. Green eds. (Academic Press, London 1976).
- [12] For a recent review see J. Zinn-Justin, *Vector models in the large N limit: a few applications*, lecture notes of the 11th Taiwan Spring School, Taipei 1997, Saclay preprint SPhT/97-018, hep-th/9810198.
- [13] R.A. Ferrel and D.J. Scalapino, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 29 (1972) 413; A. Aharony, *Phys. Rev.* B10 (1974) 2834.
- [14] J. Ashmore, *Lett. Nuovo Cimento* 4 (1972) 289; G. 't Hooft and M. Veltman, *Nucl. Phys.* B44 (1972) 189; C.G. Bollini and J.J. Giambiaggi, *Phys. Lett.* 40B (1972) 566, *Nuovo Cimento* 12B (1972).